Russell Squire
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager

505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com – Website
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan

July 25, 2022

Honorable Sarah Carroll, Chair
NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission
Municipal Building
One Center Street, 9th Floor
New York, New York 10007

RE: 1014 Fifth Avenue (Metropolitan Museum Historic District) - *KARO Architects LLP* - A Beaux-Arts style townhouse designed by Welch, Smith, & Provost and constructed in 1906-1907. Application is for replacement of all front windows, replacement of entry door, horizontal extension on 3rd and 4th floors in rear, addition of 5th floor roof terrace in rear and new landscaping in the rear yard.

Dear Chair Carroll,

At the Full Board meeting of Community Board 8 Manhattan held on July 20, 2022, the board unanimously approved the following resolution by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

WHEREAS 1014 Fifth Avenue is a six-story townhouse in the Metropolitan Museum Historic District originally built as a private residence and formerly used as Goethe House; and

WHEREAS significant changes to the Fifth Avenue façade (window replacement, alterations to the front yard and the removal of the stoop) beginning in the 1920's have altered the building's original appearance while maintaining its original, residential character; and

WHEREAS the building has remained vacant since Goethe House moved out in 2009; and

WHEREAS the owners of the building, the German Republic, passed ownership to a not-for-profit organization, 1014 Inc for the purpose of reopening the building to transatlantic cultural exchange activities; and

WHEREAS the applicants have requested a rear extension on the upper floors; and

WHEREAS the applicant seeks a Certificate of Appropriateness broken into four categories:

1. West façade (Fifth Avenue)
2. East façade (rear yard)
3. North and South Facades (side yards)
4. Roof/Bulkhead replacement; and,

WHEREAS for the Fifth Avenue façade applicant proposes a program of limestone cleaning and repair, repairs to the copper roof, ornamental metalwork cleaning and repair, window replacement in kind (with better thermal performance) on the second and third floors; and

WHEREAS the new windows replacing the double-hung windows on the fourth, fifth and sixth floors with casement windows replicating the appearance of the existing windows; and

WHEREAS the existing first floor window will be replaced with a modern style steel construction, and the existing double entry door will be replaced by a single blackened steel pivot door; and

WHEREAS the existing non-original sidewalk extension will be occupied by a semicircular limestone bench facing the building, and the existing concrete paving replaced by limestone pavers; and

WHEREAS the applicant proposes a backlit vitrine perpendicular to Fifth Avenue for the purpose of advertising programs at 1014 Fifth Avenue; and

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to introduce a flat glass and black steel canopy at the entrance; and

WHEREAS the applicant proposes a substantial addition to the rear of the third, fourth and fifth floors with a balcony at the third-floor level, a double height common room with a glazed east wall, and a terrace enclosed on three sides; and

WHEREAS the proposed addition does not increase the building footprint and is not visible from the public way; and

WHEREAS the additional building mass will be clad, insofar as it is not windowed in brick compatible with existing construction; and

WHEREAS additional glazing will be steel, and existing windows will be replaced in kind; and

WHEREAS the side yard facades will be extended at the third through sixth levels presenting blank brick facades to the neighboring buildings approximately eleven feet away; and

WHEREAS the rooftop alterations will be primarily mechanical equipment and elevator/stair bulkheads and not visible from either the public way nor the main entry stairs to the Metropolitan Museum of Art across Fifth Avenue; and

WHEREAS seven members of the public testified in opposition to the proposal, citing issues related to:

- The inappropriate modernity of the proposed entry door
- The potential nuisance of the illuminated vitrine through light pollution
- The encroachment of the inappropriately detailed limestone bench on the sidewalk and the public way and its potential as an attractive nuisance for persons who would not be visible from the sidewalk
- The inappropriate glass entrance canopy
- The additional mass at the rear which will compromise light and air to the apartments facing it across the narrow lightwells to the north and south
- The potential for noise pollution from the expanded facility, particularly from the open terrace (with enclosed walls north and south) at the upper level; and

WHEREAS the members of the Committee in attendance enthusiastically agreed with the public comments; and

WHEREAS the proposed interventions, in particular the first-floor entrance, landscape, fenestration canopy and illuminated vitrine present an inappropriately commercial image and run counter to the building's residential qualities and the residential nature of this portion of Fifth Avenue; and

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

Sincerely,

Russell Squire *David Helpern and Jane Parshall*

Russell Squire
Chair

David Helpern and Jane Parshall
Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

cc: Honorable Eric Adams, Mayor of the City of New York
Honorable Carolyn Maloney, 12th Congressional District Representative
Honorable Mark Levine, Manhattan Borough President
Honorable Liz Krueger, NYS Senator, 28th Senatorial District
Honorable José M. Serrano, NYS Senator, 29th Senatorial District
Honorable Dan Quart, NYS Assembly Member, 73rd Assembly District
Honorable Rebecca Seawright, NYS Assembly Member 76th Assembly District
Honorable Julie Menin, NYC Council Member, 5th Council District
Honorable Keith Powers, NYC Council Member, 4th Council District